



Your Ref: **08/02476/CCAC & COPP** Our Ref: **0991**
Subject: **Outline planning permission for residential development including the retention of the existing facade and erection of 12 storey building**
Station Court Home
4 Bennoch Road, Kirkcaldy
-
Date: **24-Oct-08**

the
Tobacco Merchants
House
42 Miller Street
Glasgow
G1 1DT

Tel: 0141-221 1466
Fax: 0141-248 6952

Scottish Charity No.
SC012569

The Trust has examined this application by Dow Investments Ltd (Davidson Design Partnership) for the above and wishes to comment as follows:

The Trust wishes to object strongly to this application.

Demolition in a conservation area is a serious matter. Sections 4.26 and 4.28 of the Memorandum of Guidance detail the responsibilities around demolition of unlisted buildings within conservation areas.

'The demolition of even a single building and the construction of a new building or buildings in its place could result in the character or appearance of a conservation area, or part of it, being severely prejudiced. In such circumstances, the whole purpose of designating the conservation area could be undermined.'
(4.26)

'If the building is considered to be of any value, either in itself or as part of a group, a positive attempt should always be made by the planning authority to achieve its retention, restoration and sympathetic conversion to some other compatible use before proposals to demolish are seriously investigated.'
(4.28)

The demolition of the majority of this historic building has not been justified by the applicant. Although currently vacant, the existing building appears to be in fair condition and structurally sound. The defects mentioned appear minor and no evidence has been presented that the building is incapable of reuse. In addition, the facade retention proposed by this application is facadism of the worst kind. The new build element behind the existing facade is totally unsympathetic to the existing building in terms of style and materials and is executed in an incredibly clumsy manner which leaves the existing facade meaningless and makes the new build appear to 'grow' upwards from the wall head of the historic facade.

The Trust feels that the existing building is capable of conversion to flats and would prefer a scheme of internal alterations and demolition of the extensions where necessary in order to allow to provide flatted dwellings within the shell of the existing building.

The 12 storey tower element of the application is totally out of character with this part of the conservation area which consists of relatively low level development. As such it would have a significant negative effect on the setting of the group of B listed buildings in this area consisting of the Adam Smith Theatre, the war memorial, the art gallery and museum and the gardens and on the character of the conservation area. In addition to being a huge overdevelopment of this site, the proposed new build is inappropriate in terms of style, materials, scale and

Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts

Application for Planning Permission and/or Listed Building Consent, etc.

massing for the conservation area. In this significant site we would expect to see a far higher level of design quality than is being offered by this application.

In summary while we would be pleased to see a scheme for the reuse of this building the Trust must strongly object to this application. The demolition of the unlisted building is unjustified and the facade retention would have a negative impact on the positive contribution this building makes to the conservation area. Both the facade retention and the tower would have a significant detrimental effect on the conservation area and surrounding listed buildings due to scale, style, and materials.



Gemma Wild
Technical Officer (Conservation and Design)

To Head of Development Services, Fife Council
cc Historic Scotland (Robin Evetts)
AHSS

Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts
Application for Planning Permission and/or Listed Building Consent, etc.